

SOUTH HAMS DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE



Minutes of a meeting of the **South Hams Development Management Committee** held on **Wednesday, 8th July, 2020 at 10.00 am** at the **Via Skype**

Present: **Councillors:**

Chairman Cllr Brazil
Vice Chairman Cllr Foss

Cllr Brown
Cllr Holway
Cllr Abbott
Cllr Long
Cllr Pringle

Cllr Hodgson
Cllr Rowe
Cllr Kemp
Cllr Pannell
Cllr Taylor

In attendance:

Councillors:

Cllr O'Callaghan

Cllr Pearce

Officers:

Senior Specialist – Planning
Specialist Project Officer (DM)
Deputy Monitoring Officer
Affordable Housing Officer
Senior Specialist (Natural Resources & Green Infrastructure)
Specialist (Place Making)
Democratic Services Manager
Specialist – Democratic Services

1. **Minutes**
DM.01/20
The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 11th March 2020 were confirmed as a correct record by the Chairman.
2. **Declarations of Interest**
DM.02/20
Members and officers were invited to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered and the following were made:

Cllr R Rowe declared a personal interest in application **2434/18/ARMOPA** as she was a Member of the South Devon AONB Partnership Committee. She remained in the meeting and took part in the debate and vote thereon:

Cllr B Taylor declared a personal interest in application **2434/18/ARMOPA** as he was a Member of the South Devon AONB Partnership Committee. Cllr Taylor was also absent from the DM Committee on 12th February when this application was original heard and deferred, therefore although he remained in the meeting, Cllr Taylor took no part in the debate nor vote thereon:

3. **Public Participation**

DM.03/20

The Chairman announced the list of members of the public and town and parish council representatives, who had registered their wish to speak at the meeting.

4. **Planning Applications**

DM.04/20

The Committee considered the details of the planning application prepared by the Planning Case Officer as presented in the agenda papers, and considered also the comments of Town and Parish Councils, together with other representations received, which were listed within the presented agenda reports, and **RESOLVED** that:

a) 2434/18/ARM "Allocated Site K5", Land at SX 729 440, West Alvington Hill, Kingsbridge

Town: Kingsbridge

Development: READVERTISEMENT (Revised Plans Received and Amended Description) – Application for approval of reserved matters (appearance, landscaping, layout and scale) for 53 no. dwellings and associated garages, infrastructure and landscaping following outline approval 28/0508/15/O for up to 60 no. dwellings, 0.5 hectares of employment land, 2 no. vehicular accesses, open space, play provision and drainage.

On 12th February 2020, the Development Management Committee considered this reserved matters application and following the officer presentation, public speaking and member debate, the committee resolved to defer the application for the following reasons:

1. *The siting of affordable homes across the site*
2. *Clarity over DEV26 biodiversity enhancement*
3. *The number of homes accessed via steps and parking being too remote from properties in the eastern portion of the site*
4. *Landscaping throughout estate and opportunities for more strategic green spaces*
5. *Housing mix*

6. *Scale and massing of the flats in the south eastern corner of the site*

Case Officer Update:

Four additional letters of representation (LoR) have been received and a response from Natural England (NE) leading to further discussions with NE. Additional points raised in the new LoRs include reduction in height of block of flats is not enough to fit in with the extant buildings, lack of medical facilities and school capacity, previous application has been rejected by the Planning Inspector, access road is not wide enough at exit point, red line shown incorrectly and the applicant does not own the hedge but Devon District Council does, issuing false or misleading certificate (although the Case Officer explained that there is no certificate for red line plan nor reserved matters so this was not misleading and would have been clarified at outline stage).

Natural England have requested more information on foul water drainage and surface water drainage into estuary and SSSI. The case officer confirmed that foul water drainage had been dealt with at outline stage with no outstanding off-site obligations on the applicant. Applicant was originally seeking confirmation of compliance with Condition 12, surface water drainage and was awaiting confirmation of acceptability from Natural England. It has been agreed to remove consideration of this condition from the recommendation to allow NE to confirm they are satisfied with the surface water drainage proposals. Local Lead Flood Authority have confirmed they are satisfied with the intended scheme in terms of run off rate and water quality. As this is a requirement to be discharged before works can start, the case officer felt that this could be dealt with at a later date.

Recommendation: Grant reserved matters consent and discharge conditions 11 (foul drainage), 14 (landscaping) and 18 (LEMP) of 28/0508/15/O.

Review of reasons of deferral:

1. Affordable homes – pair moved into western portion, so now have four in western and 12 in eastern sections. Nine in block of flats, now grouping well within emerging SPD. Affordable housing team happy with mix and distribution of affordable housing as it now stands.

Following questions from Members, the Case Officer clarified that the siting of affordable homes would be secured through the provisions of the existing S106. A Ward Member noted that the affordable houses were still congregated into limited areas, and that the steepest slope of the site was across the social housing area, whilst statistically those utilising social housing were more likely to have disabilities than the general populace.

2. Clarity over DEV26 bio enhancement – specific cirl bunting and reptile mitigation area on edge of development, 1/3 of area mown each year in rotation. This area specifically designed for cirl buntings, reptiles and re-hedging and would be fenced off. Separate open spaces for public use and increased wild flower and tree planting in the development, along with bat and bird boxes. Some existing hedgerows retained but some removed to allow for access into the development. Senior Specialist (Natural Resources & Green Infrastructure) had approved plans in terms of DEV26. One tree removed and some hedging to allow for lower entry into development. Access points approved at first stage.

Following questions from Members, the case officer confirmed that a corner of the biodiversity offset area would be used as construction storage area and then would be returned to mitigation at the end of construction. CO also confirmed that outlying consent lists that the trees within public spaces would be under control of the management company and would be replaced at the next planting season if they died within the first five years.

Members asked for TPOs (Tree Preservation Order) to be added to any new tree planted.

The Senior Specialist (Natural Resources & Green Infrastructure) confirmed that the number of bat and bird boxes, while on the low side, was within guidelines in the emerging SPD.

3. Steps and remote parking at Eastern site. The case officer outlined the amendments made to the plan: the proposal to bring in a new footpath link higher up the hill avoiding steps, giving additional pedestrian access for those living in the units. An alternative design of introducing a snaking footpath had been considered but it was decided that the loss of open space and play area, on balance, was too great. Wheeling ramps to be added to any steps which would help move bikes up and down steps.

Some Members felt that the proposed footpath was too long a detour and a slope would be better for prams and wheelchair users. However, other Members felt that the loss of open space was too great a compromise for the slope, with one Member saying pram use was easier with steps as rests could be taken.

4. Landscaping throughout estate and more green space – more tree planting has been added to help soften the development. Increased strategic open space due to proposed new pathway.
5. Housing Mix – although the housing mix was not reserved matters, the applicant had changed one four bed house into a pair of semi-detached two bedroom units.

6. Scale and massing of the flats in the SE corner of the site – part of the apartment block has been reduced in height by a storey.

Members were still very concerned with the appearance and siting of the block of flats, commenting that the height of the block was still overpowering considering the height and style of nearby housing. Members commented that the site is at the entrance to the AONB and on the edge of Kingsbridge and that the current design and siting of the block of flats was not good enough for the AONB, being end on to the road and completely uncharacteristic for Kingsbridge.

Members also expressed grave concerns for the trees and hedgerow along the site. Whilst the majority of the hedgerow and all bar one tree are in the plan and therefore to be kept, it was felt that the siting of the block of flats at only 6 metres from back edge of the footway and 1.4 metres from the trees and hedgerow, would result in damage to same during the build. Members stated that the loss of these mature trees would impinge greatly on the AONB.

Several Members also commented on the design of the block of flats commenting that it was bland in design with lots of render, but is strategic view as come up the hill. The applicant confirmed that the natural stone lower portion and slate roof had been a clear preference of in order to satisfy Policies DEV10 and DEV 20 and respect the local vernacular.

Committee Decision: Deferral

Reasons for Deferral:

As outlined in greater detail above:

3. The number of homes accessed via steps, and parking being too remote from properties in the eastern portion of the site, not sufficiently addressed.
6. Scale and massing of the block of flats in the south eastern corner of the site – particularly in relation to the close proximity to the existing trees and hedgerow on West Alvington Hill, and in terms of siting within the AONB

5. **Planning Appeals Update**

DM.05/20

Deferred due to absence of Development Management Manager.

The Meeting concluded at 1.31 pm

Signed by:

Chairman
